

CULTURAL MANAGER: OFFICIAL LATTER UNDER CONSTRUCTION

José Carlos Durand*

The purpose herein is to give sense to the set of teaching experience reported in the International Meeting Cultural Management Training (hereinafter only Meeting), discussing phenomena and processes related to the origins and evolution of cultural management training courses, and to construction, still incipient, of a new identity: the culture manager. As emerging occupation of the tertiary sector, located at the intersection of the artistic, political-administrative (and private management) fields, its understanding requires an analysis of these two spaces, each with its own logic. As the object of pedagogical transmission, it involves the conditions of its implementation and operation within schools, subject, in turn, to a third logic: the education systems.

In order to handle articulations among these three domains - artistic, politicaladministrative and educational - a path has been chosen which begins (1) defining what in sociology features an emerging occupation in contrast with a profession established in organizational terms; then, (2) stating depth changes that have been changing, since the late nineteenth century, the conception of both art and artist life, with implications on the conditions for the exercise of intermediary activities included therein and their forms of acquisition and reproduction of aesthetical provisions and technical competences; pointing out, then, (3) the proliferation of (uni)disciplinary¹ knowledge (anthropology, sociology, semiology, communication, history, aesthetics) responsible for colossal bibliographies available today about culture, and the difficulties in choosing contents for cultural management students and in transmitting them in the right dosage and minimally consistent with the profile that you want to build; (4) showing how the growing strength of movements for social inclusion in Latin America has been pushing for more schools and less social, ethnic and geographical discrimination in access to education, a process that affects the cultural manager training; and (5) as the opposite movement of education privatization in neoliberal logic of globalization, it has

^{*} Sociologist of culture, accredited professor of the graduate program in Cultural Studies of Arts, Sciences and Humanities College of Universidade de São Paulo. The author thanks both Helena Bartolomeu and Ligia Azevedo, from Sesc-SP, for their contribution in the preparation of the accompanying notes of the Meeting presentations.

¹ Any human science area in a cultural management course is hereby considered "discipline", exempting hereinafter the use of the prefix "uni" to avoid redundancy.

conditioned training courses creation and expansion strategies in private business education institutions (in Europe and also in Latin America); then, (6) observations are made about virtual education and information is provided about the general status of association among managers in Brazil and neighboring countries. Finally, in the conclusions and recommendations, it is emphasized that the rationality inherent in the administration poses no risk whatsoever to the free exercise of management committed to the enthusiasm, ethics and values of the artistic and cultural life. It finally suggests that an improvement of the manager training level can be achieved provided that they take a step beyond what prevails today: either paid courses with marketing guidance, but without deeper ballast into cultural economy, law and cultural policy, or free of charge courses in public institutions, popular and community oriented, committed to the citizenship development as a condition of advancing democracy, but which seem to suffer from the same deficiency.

1. The logic of professional power and emerging occupations

The number, size and relative position of each occupation in a dynamic market economy are always changing. Technological evolution, subject to competition for profit, which moves forward or backward at different speeds depending on the sector of the economy, changes the composition of the workforce and the level of remuneration for each category of worker. Government intervention, either as direct employer, mediator of private competition, regulator of the education system and provider of education, also affects the overall picture of the offer and demand for skills. It is in a configuration like this that the competition among the occupations is established for social space, income and prestige.

It is essential, however, not to reduce this complex logic to pure impersonal forces of the economy. Beyond its determinations, there is the incessant political and symbolic work that members of an occupation are always performing. It is necessary to give name and legalize the occupation, distinguishing it from neighboring occupations; maintain distance or create restrictions to those who learned only in practice; establish access rules, preferably qualification certificates requirements, such as diplomas; guide their members in terms of how much and how to charge for their work. In the limit, also to ensure that an extremely high number of new practitioners each year is not titled, able to precipitate the remuneration debasement. This last combat is made, when possible (i.e. when the correlation of forces allows), by seeking the closure of doubtful quality courses. Moreover, people in general oriented themselves to occupations that their families know best, which are part of their "potential field" – those that the parents recommend (or not) for their sons and daughters and consider more appropriate for women than for men, or *vice versa*. The occupational heredity is a fact, and follows the rules of kinship group reproduction, reaching at the limit, the existence of true family dynasties in certain professions.

The top of the occupational pyramid defined by white-collar jobs requires higher education levels, is a space where a large number of occupations is always competing in search of a better position and a small number of the oldest and most established professions. The members of the latter come more often from higher socioeconomic and educational strata. At its peak are those known as liberal professions, which, say again, are also in the medium and long term subject to market forces and may lose position due to such dynamics, and have their prestige and income reduced. An established profession is immediately known by name, stated in a single word, such as medicine, engineering, law, and its practitioners: doctor, engineer, and lawyer. You can add an indicator of expertise, for example, orthopedic doctor, civil engineer, criminal lawyer, but it is clear enough adjectives in the theory, education, regulations and practice.

In general, everyone knows that long and often expensive studies must be done in order to ingress in a liberal profession and that it is not worth leaving college without a diploma. This is, after all, the document certifying the competence acquired, and its registration is necessary, and a *sine qua non* condition for the exercise of the activity. Consequently, the energies of students preparing for liberal professions are relentlessly balanced to meet all requirements of the diploma within the minimum predicted time, purging up to the maximum the personal velleities, likings, whims and preferences, the interruptions, ultimately, everything with which the artists often delight.

If compensation levels are proportionally related with the number of years that lasts a university education for a liberal profession, one must avoid that colleges, within the limits of their autonomy, reduce the minimum time required to obtain the diploma. In turn, access control to the profession and permanence therein are made under the power of the law, delegating authority to professional associations to restrain malpractice and improbities. Through these organizations, orchestrated with the academic community, the individual competence is measured via peer review, which in general is always justified by the need to serve society well (Maurice, 1972). It is stated that, decades ago, two American economists, when seeking an example of pure monopoly, happened to find it in medical fees in their country, also noting that the entry of new practitioners could barely keep up with population growth, so strong was the "Malthusian" containment policy of physician population, aiming at sustaining the said monopoly power: in short, a true cartel (Friedman and Kuznets, 1945). Remember that the power of the liberal professions in establishing compensation in negotiations with the client has been greatly reduced due to the presence of other forces: in case of physicians, the health insurance, the large hospitals and private or public clinics, the insurance companies etc. In short: own name, solid technical and scientific ballast, social and legally guaranteed by the diploma, control of the professional activity by the community of peers, rhetoric of service provision to the community and recruitment predominant in privileged social strata comprised the typical traits of the liberal professions in Western countries in the mid-twentieth century. The neoliberal outbreak and subsequent deregulation of the economy take strength from attempts to regulate professions.

By contrast, an emerging occupation does not yet have known and recognized name, it is not object of rights and prerogatives, it does not offer a secure identity in the professional world and it does not enable who needs to enroll in public sector recruitment examination. By not having its own and accurate knowledge institution as base, it runs the risk of seeing its teaching programs agglutinate little systematic disciplines, sometimes incongruent and mismatched, at the mercy of bureaucratic and opportunistic conveniences that define teaching load and the departmental allocation of faculty and the interests of power and/or profit of the academic managers and/or college owners. Often considered alternatives of relegation in school selection, the emerging occupations have relatively little power to select in the input. It ended up, therefore, recruiting students with more precarious education than that of those accepted in known and recognized courses. It can happen even if the completion of a course designed for an emerging occupation is not seen as an essential requirement for access to professional life that also it is not a sufficiently clear and foreseeable horizon. In such cases, dropping out of college when a job appears and resuming when it vanishes is a very normal attitude. A characteristic of emerging professions in the social area, where they lack a defined scientific technical ballast is to present themselves publicly through

a speech that practically is limited to reiterate adherence to moral and ethical principles. Not that ethics and morality are not requirements to any professional, what they cannot overcome is the lack of a specific competence that supports the claims of the group.

2. The charismatic logic of the art and the conditions of its administration

A century and half ago, a deep transformation has been triggered in the Western art world, which led to the decline of the institutional power (languages and fine arts academies, conservatories etc.) to define what is and what is no longer aesthetic, what should or needs to be taught to an apprentice, the steps that must be satisfied for an artist career, the topics or subjects that may be considered worthy of aesthetic treatment and of storage in memory.

The modernist revolution, as it is known, supported the art notion on a principle of absolute, incessant creation, charismatically defining the artist as a being rebel to any established rules, hierarchies of ancient academies and hostile to taste standards and to morality of aristocratic or bourgeois employers. Consubstantiated in the principle of "art for art's sake", that is, the independence of the artist in relation to any outside imposition (power, money, religion, family duty), the new aesthetic ideology is built **against the logic of professional power**. Compliance with the idea that the artistic medium is (and should remain) a clear, fluid and gelatinous space, the principle that everything can be art, depending on the viewpoint that builds it as aesthetic fact, the presumption that the artwork involves screening exercise, as a condition of the full enjoyment of the work, everything finally consecrated the idea of irreducibility of the artist and artwork to any fixed value paradigm and its repulsion to any external constraint to the artistic medium (Bourdieu , 1992).

The transition to the "modern" or "postmodern", from the mid-twentieth century, did not do more than absolutize derangement triggered by the modernist revolution. The end result, what matters in this report, is that the new intermediation occupations between artist and audience, including the cultural manager, had to adjust to the new scenario of the art world and to the new logic of presentation, disclosure and promotion of the artist, sponsors' attraction and receptor public formation. The French economist Nathalie Moureau (1995) appealed to the typology of Mintzberg, exposed in the work *Structure et dynamique des organisations*, 1982, to decide which of its five paradigms of

administrative organization would be best suited to the contemporary world of arts. Concluded that it is the "adhocracy" model, i.e. the less imposing, less formalized, less hierarchical, less stable and the more flexible pattern of organization and control of labor and cooperation between individuals. Moreover, it is noteworthy to stress that the "adhocratic" model entered into a generalized ascension from the neoliberal expansion of capitalism, post-1980, as large corporations began to "outsource" functions, converting former employees in autonomous service providers, responsible for organizing their personal and contributor's work subject to each signed agreement, each project to be executed. In other words, and to general astonishment: living with the precariousness of employment and the work at home, old realities of the art world, started since then to be glorified as an expression of creativity, ingenuity, as fundamental virtues of a new "entrepreneurship" era, intended to boost the cumbersome and little innovative structures of the large corporations (Boltanski and Chiapello, 2009).

3. The disciplinary knowledge gigantism accumulated from culture

Having to deal with a large spectrum culture notion, ranging from the aesthetic to anthropological, as tends to be a consensus today, is source of enormous difficulty for the cultural manager.

If the world of aesthetics and its surrounding always define themselves by the minimum ("unique" artist, "rare" sensibility, "exclusive" taste, "unprecedented" occasion, "genius" moment, "personal" tone, etc.), the culture world, as tailored by the anthropologists follows the opposite principle, of the maximum common denominator, including everything that transcends nature. Between the almost nothing of the aesthetic and the almost everything of the culture, there is a chasm of uncertainties that much affects the safety of those wishing to engage in any intermediation activity inside it. It appears as radically opposed situation, for example, between the cultural and sports manager. In the latter area, everything is structured into a finite number of modalities, governed by clear rules, enforced by a referee, in its own physical space, with start and end known. Everything is so clear that the sponsors may (as in soccer) place their brands and logos on the players' uniform, without affecting the emotion of the game and the championship agenda.

To navigate the ocean of cultural theories, this is the vastness of disciplinary knowledge (anthropology, sociology, semiology, communication, etc.), and the consequent gigantism of the bibliographies available in the academic collections in this new century, there is no escape from the crucial issue in the manager training: what to select as indispensable amid so much literature about art and culture? Some speak of "brushing up", using metaphor removed before the impressionist making rather than the details of the realist composition. Is that possible? It is worth remembering that if the impressionist painters masterfully solved their compositions with few brush ups is because they had previously prepared to display everything with meticulous precision of academic painting. "Whoever can do more, can do less", say the jurists.

Actually, neither the aesthetic nor the anthropologic give in without much reading. How to think of them at the proper measure of the cultural manager need, without overdriving him/her with a paralyzing excess texts? How to define such need?

To obtain an initial indication, the speakers were asked who the most important authors would be, who would be reference in theoretical education transmitted in the teaching programs that each of them coordinated.

After stressing that every teacher, in the same program, had freedom of bibliographic choice, the speakers did not fail to mention names. The weight of the Marxist tradition in Brazilian social sciences responds directly or indirectly by the quotes of Antonio Gramsci and Theodor Adorno, the founders of cultural studies (Raymond Williams, Stuart Hall, Edward Thompson), or also the exponents of the current thinking on ethics and right issues (Jurgen Habermas), and inequality and poverty (Amartya Sen). Pierre Bourdieu and Edgar Morin were also cited. As anthropologists, Edward Tylor, Clifford Geertz, as well as a number of Brazilian intellectuals, living or dead, with progressive position taken, as Alfredo Bosi, Marilena Chauí, Paulo Freire, Celso Furtado, Milton Santos and Muniz Sodré. Regarding the Latin American neighbors, Rubens Bayardo, Edward Said and Néstor García Canclini were also cited. In only two cases, an exclusive name was cited as inspiring: Manuel Castells, the representative of Girona, Spain, and Father Lebret, Catholic humanist, the representative of Uruguay.

It became clear, in some reports, the impression that theoretical knowledge (in particular derived from the human sciences, but also from the aesthetic, philosophical lineage) as already discredited inset in manager training curriculum. Because this is preparation for action, theoretical disciplines, such as those taught in professional training curricula, are

often seen as manifestations of university rigidity and/or of professorial accommodation to authors and theories of little relevance. In this sense, the possibility of interdisciplinary bachelors, introduced by the university reform of 2008, which allows students to build their own curriculum, was highlighted as very important, at least in the testimony of the representative of Bahia.

By extension, the agencies representing the power of academic disciplines in the government bureaucracy, as the Commission for Improvement of Higher Education Personnel (Capes) or the National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (CNPq) – both of the Brazilian federal government and of decisive importance in the conduct of university policy – are seen as intransigent in not recognizing hybrid programs and do not cooperate to the advance of new areas of teaching and research, which require inter/multi/trans/poly or post-disciplinary formulations. The multiplicity, both in the prefixes and in the speech set, is an incontestable responsibility of the area, which aims, according to a participant, at "thinking communication and cultural phenomena in multiple and unfinished public spaces, of permeable frontiers."

The cultural management training is intended to prepare people for action, and this is the central element in all manifestations heard. Training for an action, not to be blind or mechanic, needs to make sense via "understanding of the world we live in", whence the relevance of willingness to animate (in the sense of "giving life"); to establish contacts without hierarchical distances; to be curious, self-critical and have spirit of research; to be gracious, hospitable and associative, sensitive to cultural effervescence of your surroundings, discerning, anytime, possible partners. Understanding the market, namely budget and cut costs². Such set of virtues is also expected from the artists, since the current conditions require them to increasingly manage their own careers³.

In short, **the manager needs to be generalist**, being unthinkable to train someone in only one aesthetic language or cultural theory. Between knowing to direct an orchestra or play an instrument, the cultural manager should think as regent.

 $^{^{2}}$ "Cut, cut, cut...", as the representative of the University of Barcelona said, with resigned air, alluding to the current European crising.

³ In times of globalization and internet, this management unfolds in managing *sites* and personal *blogs*, for the incessant updating of curricula nd, where possible, maintenance of offices and workshops in more than on country, contracting services (secretaries, *marchands*, press advisers, literary agents; in fine arts, even artisans to perform with the hands the ideas of conceptual artists). For more information about it, in a pre-internet era, see Durand (2009).

Another participant of the event discards emphasis on some particular theory, saying that the manager is not an expert nor in any artistic language, or in some social space: he/she must be an "expert in the social organization of culture", since only then will know to transit from a classic music project to conservation of Indian handicrafts; or someone - according to another participant - who knows to "dialogue with the cultural contexts", which is the same virtue in other words. For a better idea of the greater or lesser difficulty in inculcating values and personal willingness in the education training of the cultural managers, it is advisable to delimit two distinct universes where they see their education taking place, taking, for convenience, the case of Brazil.

3. Educational inclusion and manager training in popular and community environment

The narrative of the origins and mode of construction of curricula in cultural management in the federal universities of Brazil (four cases) eloquently put the conflicts and tensions of a university system in rapid incorporation of subaltern social segments. As it could not fail to happen, in a moment one wants, with commitment, to reduce the socio-economic, ethnic and geographic selectivity of high school and higher education, the alternative of technical-professional education gains priority. In this sense, a rearticulation of professional education was promoted in 2008 in the country, by transforming technical schools into a network of 38 federal institutes of education, science and technology. They are "institutions of higher education, basic and professional, pluricurriculars and multicampi, specialized in offering professional and technological knowledges to their teaching practices. Half of the seats in these institutes will be intended to offer technical courses at high school level, in special integrated-curriculum courses⁴."

Also serving students from historically marginalized ethnic groups gains priority through the implementation of a quota system for the access to higher education of applicants self-classified as non-white, and those who have previously attended

⁴The technology graduation is in the context of Education Bases and Guideline Law (LDB), of 1996, which proposed the Professional Education Reform and thus began to organize it as a modality able to perpassar the basic and higher levels of education. Therefore, it is formalized by the Ministry of Education (MEC) and have the National Curriculum Guidelines approved by the National Council of Education. See http://pt.wikipedia.org/InstitutoFederal de Educação, Ciência e Tecnologia>; accessed on:3 Sep. 2012.

elementary and secondary education in public schools. The reason is that these two traits, more than others, mark pretty well the class character of the Brazilian educational system which systematically excludes African descent (and ethnic minorities such as Indians) and favors well-succeeded students on admission exams (vestibular) for having obtained better education in private and paid schools.

Such educational policy guidelines, by the way, fall on the principles of social inclusion pursued by the coalition of parties that won the presidential election in 2002, 2006 and 2010 and are in line with the commitment to increase the space of popular cultures in terrain of federal cultural policy. The Living Culture program (which includes the network of Culture Points) of the Ministry of Culture of Brazil, is the best example of this orientation, which, by the way, is already being followed by several neighboring countries⁵.

All in all, the formation of cultural managers is shown inserted in a process that, as it should be, is vulnerable to criticism regarding intellectual precariousness of their students. There were dispirited reports at the Meeting, recognizing that cultural management students often did not have any cultural leisure themselves, and had to be patiently taken by the teachers, for the first time, to a movie theater or a museum⁶. Others also confirmed the need to strengthen skills in reading, writing and arithmetic. Moreover, the need to design and implement curricula for technical-professional education (three years), lasting less than traditional degrees (four years), faces resistance, both from those likely to see the technical diplomas as "inferior", and those that anticipate the difficulties that a reduced-time higher degree diploma will put them in the future.

The feeling of dispirit regarding the students' knowledge deficits until it is relieved when one observes that, in cultural management, the origin family repertory may also be a trump. The anthropologist who coordinates the higher education course of Technology in Cultural Production in Nilópolis, in Baixada Fluminense, narrated that in the vicinity of the school there is always the "social scoundrel" and the "party girls", extroverted people and willing to organize and attend parties and art performances, once

⁵ See <www.pontosdecultura.org.br/noticias/cultura-viva-na-america-latina/>; accessed on:3 Sep 2012. Also see Silva (2007).

⁶ The same is noted in higher education courses in tourism, with students who had never traveled outside their city, not to mention their neighborhood.

they bring that - one can add - in their primary *habitus*, which is the same as the immediate environment in which they live in.

When one cannot incorporate experienced professionals to the faculty to help define the profile of skills that, in fact, will give consistency to the program and hopes of future employment to student, school dropout will be a big threat. Artifices need to be adopted to combat it: equalization of requirements so that the courses taken are eligible for credit in other graduation, helping to keep the student in school, now encouraged to move from a shortened training to a "full" graduation. In short: the training of the cultural manager becomes a "step" to another career. The extension of schooling in a graduation from the same institution (which exempts the student from taking a new admission exam - vestibular) mitigates the discomfort of the student of not being able to unveil a minimally secure labor market.

By looking at cases relating to other Latin American countries, there is also the flourishing of a community approach in cultural management. The narrative of cultural manager mobilization in Chile is being made, according to the speaker "outside the State and despite it". Being a country that implemented a paid and expensive⁷ education system and that reduced the government presence to a collegiate body, the National Council of Culture, Chile is structuring a strong associative movement of cultural managers, who meet and form associations and make meetings. They consider the singer Violeta Parra a king of illustrious predecessor in an effort to be surrounded by people and emerge therein, as she did after the success in Paris, erecting a community space for music and gastronomy near Santiago. In Argentina, there is mention that the "technical degrees" in cultural management, created from 1984 (i.e. after the dictatorship), refused the original neoliberal orientation and inclined to the community and third sector. Festivals are organized by those in favor of this movement, as confraternization and opportunity to disclose the occupation and raise funds. Detailed surveys of local cultural management and its budgetary resources begin to be made, committed to reach a more capillary vision of what goes on in that country.

In addition, one can note the commitment of coordinators in their teaching programs in cultural management to not only circumvent the rigidity of disciplinary curricula, but to also find means of reaching wider audiences. Accordingly, the inter-university agreements, which have become common in the globalized neoliberal university,

⁷In Santiago, in 2011, one could read on the walls: "Somos estudiantes, no clientes!" (We are students, not clients!).

introducing distance courses through Internet, or semipresential modalities, appear as well attractive solutions, although still rare in Brazil.

4. Globalization, managerialism and manager training

According to a recent assessment of globalized education (Leclerc-Olive, Ghellab and Wagner, 2011), it was in 1998 that the World Trade Organization (WTO) eliminated barriers that hindered the free exchange of "education services", particularly the State monopolies, limitations on immigration of students and preventing mergers and acquisitions among schools. Since then, the education market tends to be considered a service market like any other. The concepts of "knowledge economy" and "cognitive capitalism", which came into effect around the same time⁸, try to show that the market economies were moving to a new baseline, in which understanding the education as any other branch of services would be the most appropriate optics to increase the international flows of students, professors, knowledge, and in its wake, investment and employment.

The field of study that emerged at the forefront of the process was business administration: business schools were the first to internationalize, the most important among them, based in the United States, had the opportunity to build branches or establish cooperation agreements and exchanges with similar institutions in other countries.

Teaching in English, compact and segmented courses such as MBAs (tax law, IT and telecommunications, retail, textile and fashion etc.), validation of disciplines taken in different countries, requirement of minimum percentages of foreign students and professors for a program to be sealed international, agreement with companies to guarantee internship for the students, these are all signs of a new reality that exalts the competitiveness and efficiency, and the ability to think and act beyond national borders⁹.

⁸ About the concept of cognitive capitalism, see Boutang (2010).

⁹ The internationalization of higher education **does not** tend to an egalitarian exchange between the countries nominally involved in it. Rather, it presents flows that are only regional and also serious asymmetries: a student from an Anglophone, rich and developed country will have much less willingness to learn the language of a less rich and developed "partner" country, and to consider it a potential place to work and build a career, than the reverse. See Leclerc-Olive, Ghellab and Wagner (2011, esp. p. 7-19 and p. 151-160).

Since this is a stage of capitalism in which the international mega events multiply and become, more than ever, the focus of media attention and corporate investments (Wu, 2006), the consequence is that the culture management began to gain importance, to justify special education programs. Museums, concert halls and other institutions of its kind now considered desirable partners are invited to participate in the system, providing internship opportunities for students, sending coaches and leaders to lecture in the courses and compose assessment juries of cultural projects, to serve as case studies for professors and students, to sponsor researches and "chairs" for example.

Virtually all European cases present at the Meeting (Italy, France, Spain and Portugal) have invoked such globalization profile as the context in which they have had to act. The existence of an European model of university education is mentioned, in constitution from an agreement that regulates credit accumulation and transfer. The European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS), created by the Protocol of Bologna (1999), is part of a context of joint actions to promote the mobility of students, professors and researchers, upon common criteria of curricula building and school evaluation, institutional cooperation and integrated study programs, as basis for raising the international competitiveness of the European system of higher education. According to the professor who presented the program of Universidade Lusófona do Porto, getting an European accreditation is a hard work.

But just these continental circumstances are not enough. It is necessary to add relevant institutional aspects and national circumstances. According to testimony heard at the Meeting, the advanced state of cultural management education in Spain has its origin in the Constitution of 1978, which transferred to the municipalities greater responsibility for cultural management, in a context of democratization and administrative decentralization, becoming urgent the need to qualify professionals.

In France, the University of Paris-Dauphine, restructured after the protest movements of 1968, quit humanities and focused in economy and management. Later, five art schools have been added to it, by government decision. In 1980, early in Mitterrand government, a sudden elevation of the public budget for culture (Jack Lang management) became attractive the creation of a program for cultural managers in Paris-Dauphine. To access it, the applicants should pass strict admission exam which is the same required for all who wish to enter that university, and attend strict programs of economy, marketing and administration. Dijon program, in turn, is housed in one of the

écoles de commerce (business education network maintained by employers), and it is managed in partnership with the Business School of University of Oxford Brookes, in England.

In Italy, the program is located in the secular University of Ferrara, which, in turn, also has a history of successful partnerships with American and English universities, and an entire history of adjustment to the standard of international cooperation described above.

But it is certainly more important to note that France, Italy and Spain are countries that, for long, occupy the first world places in heritage value, tourist flow, and production and export of luxury goods. These circumstances have resulted long time in the creation of statistics and analysis methods focused on these segments, and led their academics to a more advanced economic knowledge of the service sector, in particular the *lato sensu* activities related to leisure and culture. Consequently, when it was time to create training programs in cultural management, they had a ballast of knowledge in cultural politics and culture economy with which other countries (those in Latin America, for example) could not count on.

Without considering these trumps, it is not possible to understand how an European program presented at the Meeting, the Dijon's one, is able to articulate means and purposes with such clarity, as can be seen by the list of purposes that your responsible committee established for the program, in 2011:

1. Know the institutional, economic and legal scenario *specific* of the culture and creative industries

2. Master administration and finances techniques *specific* of the industry

3. Know the supply and demand rules regarding products and services of the *creative industries* in general

4. Know how to conceive and manage a cultural project, and

5. Know how to analyze the cultural policy principles *in a determined political and cultural environment.*

I highlight in italic the terms that, in my opinion, really stress what is a French, Italian or Spanish differential, regarding what can be taught to a cultural manager in Brazil and, certainly, in neighbor countries. Firstly, in Brazil it is hard to gather in the same faculty people that know the public and companies administration, culture economy and cultural rights, who are capable of teaching, even if as introduction, the fundamentals foreseen in the first purpose; is also difficult to find people familiar with the practice of

management in cultural institutions which meet the requirements of the second purpose, thirdly, there are no economists who know the laws of supply and demand in the peculiarities of the aggregate "creative industries", because the statistics that describe it do not exist or are inadequate; and finally, there are few people who know public policy and are aware of connections between government action and the general state of culture in the country to meet the ultimate purpose.

From the point of view of Latin America, Spain becomes important as a source of influence in cultural management, given the importance that its ruling class and its diplomacy give to the exchange and strengthening relationships within their linguistic community, in correspondence with the beyond-boundaries expansion of its productive and financial investments. Regarding Italy and France, it is perceived by the partners listed by the speakers, a certain inclination to economically important countries of the East: China, Japan, Korea and Australia.

However, for a more appropriate view of the implications of the ongoing globalization and privatization process in the formation of cultural managers, one must consider two **distinct situations of economic support courses**, such as seen today in Brazil.

The **first** is represented by some corporate cultural institutes that rely heavily on federal tax incentives to permanently finance the whole set of their annual program. The size of their revenues and decision autonomy both regarding government and (to some extent) the very corporations to which they are affiliated have allowed them, over the years, propose and manage a full program of activities, including research and publications, collections and databases, seminars and courses with national and international participants, art exhibitions.

The money that is so employee is exempt from the return requirements, i.e., it is not used as capital in the economic sense of the word, as are the amounts that a school owner moves to recover later, added to the rates and fees charged from the students. These resources can indeed be defined as an item of advertising expense, in the sense that they serve to symbolically reinforce the brand; however, as it comes to large sums, in renewable annual appropriations system, their volume allows a separate management, autonomous from the corporate *marketing* sector, making the commercial side more covert.

The **second** is represented by the courses offered by private schools or institutions that aim to withdraw their economic support from the revenue obtained with tuition and fees. In this logic, cultural management is an alternative within a menu of programs to be offered to the market. To choose one, among several alternatives, a relatively formalized poll is followed, which is worth reproducing in detail, in a free adaptation of the report of the Senac-SP representatives.

A private organization has a line of paid specialization courses. To create a new course (e.g. cultural management), the general coordinator of the specialization summons someone from within to help him/her in designing the curriculum. Over several months, referring to potential employers of probable future graduates, and professors of similar courses, *marketing* professionals and cultural leaders, they reach a preliminary view, to be submitted to a group of people, specially invited for the survey of interest. At the meeting, the coordination team is attentive to what is said in favor or against the course design, the guidelines that should be privileged in the construction of the curriculum and the value orientations that are at stake, with questions like: "what values do you expect to find if you hire someone from this area?" Then the program is detailed and another group is called to a meeting, unrelated to the first, but with the same profile (employers and potential students, for example). If there is consensus around the idea, a set of principles (and their repertoire of speech) will have been determined, which will be adopted at all times of the course to be offered, from the selection of professors to the conclusion work. The effort to establish the "values at stake" would correspond, according to Senac speakers, to the most current marketing design ("marketing 3") of the known theoretic Philip Kotler. For this, the history of the discipline, dating back to a century ago, has gone from an initial phase, focusing on the product, to the other focused on the customer, and hence to a third, centered on shared values, or "values marketing". The speakers are betting that this will be the dominant view in the Brazilian business community in the near future, and that therefore it is worth continuing to think and propose specialization courses according to this methodology.

5. Impact of Internet on training and association of managers

Until recently, the presence adjective usage was rare in education issues, because in principle all pedagogic action took place face to face, with the exception only of

correspondence education, statistically insignificant. The situation has changed a lot with the Internet, and it is from there that face *versus* virtual dichotomy takes place.

At the Meeting, many fully or partially virtual education programs were presented. The virtual education is driven by the realization of the possibility of expanding the receiving audience with the speed provided by the Internet in terms of disclosure, receipt of registrations, shipping of material and receipt of students' reactions. The final evaluations in distance courses are usually in person.

The virtual method also favors and is favored by interinstitutional agreements that make two or more partner universities on a new course. Such a pattern of cooperation makes it possible, ultimately, to build an "ideal" faculty, i.e., joining in the virtual world, experts on rare skills that would hardly share the teaching in a course exclusively face to face. At least that's what it is said.

As mentioned by more than one speaker, the alternative or complementation between classroom and virtual learning, in culture management, relates to the existence of two audience profiles to meet: (1) the high school youth who compete in college entrance and seek one near their homes, preferring the classroom, (2) the virtual will be chosen by adults already employed in the cultural area (especially those working in remote locations), for whom more knowledge and some degree will advance their careers. It is perhaps possible to generalize (from reports of several countries) that the preferred target audience of the programs is comprised by managers with long track record of work in the area (three years or more), more than those coming from high school. The usual focus is on classes one or two days a week in the classroom designed to track such students, to accommodate with professional duties.

Moreover, in the case of public universities with teaching gratuity set forth by law, virtual education allows a paid alternative, due to the fact that its students go beyond the limits of territorial boundaries of university attendance within which the gratuity is mandatory¹⁰. In this situation, would be the programs of Universidade de Mar del Plata and Universidade de Três de Fevereiro in Argentina¹¹. Among the cases presented,

¹⁰ This is only a hypothesis that needs to be confirmed.

¹¹ It was commented that offering of distance cultural management courses in Argentina had the previous approval of the open university modality in the country. In the text of Rafael Martinez G., "Universidad abierta", it is defined as "the university that through an innovative methodology and a curriculum developed from the demands of the learners themselves and the social environment, offers third-level studies to a population of adults in the place where he resides, under the understanding that this population is limited or unable to choose to study at school." As a result, the essential requirements thereof are turning to a particular population of adults, with an innovative methodology, on a college campus without limits and with a particular syllabus. available at:

Universidade de Guadalajara in Mexico seems to be the most advanced education on the Internet. Its coordinator is emphatic when saying that it is not enough to scan a live class, in audio and video, and broadcast it on the network, to achieve the potential of virtual education: one must go further and be prepared to interact the whole time with the student, using material prepared especially for this purpose. After all, the distance student interacts with the teacher much more intensely than in the classroom, marking the speaker that people can watch the real world to a class two or three hours without interacting with the teacher and classmates, and that this does not occur on the internet. The speaker added that is linked to the unit of Universidade de Guadalajara that explores ways to improve the distance learning - Instituto de Gestão do Conhecimento e da Aprendizagem em Ambientes Virtuais - within which administers the degree in Cultural Management. He also said that it is the virtual path that is allowing his course to be offered worldwide, even in a branch of Universidade de Guadalajara in Los Angeles, the city with the largest Mexican population outside the border.

In Brazil, out the eight programs present at the meeting, only one, from Instituto Cultural Itaú, benefits from the virtual, probably by economic means at its disposal and its institutional condition, free from the control of the Ministry of Education (MEC). Incidentally, in Brazil, even courses from private educational institutions must subject to the demands of the ministry regarding the number of class hours and other requirements¹².

But beyond the issuance and reception of content, the use of virtual on the education of cultural agents is facilitating the associative work, serving as examples the Latin American Network of Cultural Management, the National Association of Cultural Managers of Chile (Angecu), the Brazilian Association of Producers and Cultural Association of Brazilian Cultural Management (ABGC), the Association of Cultural Managers of Argentina (AgeCultRA). Incidentally, as requirements to reinforce the association and occupation promotion strategies occupation, one can mention the listings of courses and programs, which begin to be made. A study conducted in 2010 and updated in April 2012 by ABGC, recorded 89 courses, including 51 undergraduate

<http://ciruelo.uninorte.edu.co/pdf/huellas_5_huellas_5_7_UniversidadAbierta.pdf>. Access on Sept. 3, 2012 ¹² In 2010, MEC has institutionalized a National Catalog of College Technology Courses, with names, brief profile of graduates, minimum workload and infrastructure recommended for 98 degrees, organized in 10 technological axes, one of which is Cultural Production and Design. In 2008, there was in force a similar document for teaching technical level: the National Catalogue of Vocational Courses (CNCT.).

(42 technological and 9 bachelor degrees) and 6 post-graduate studies, and left out many other free or extension studies¹³.

Attempts are still in the process of aggregation and sorting associative professional designations, to discuss customarily given to graduates and those who operate in the area. For example, according to the speaker from Universidade Federal Fluminense, the more engaged on the issue, **cultural agent** would be the one working with the community, **cultural promoter**, the one that handles the advertising, broadcasting; **cultural producer** has a more operational and executive nature; **cultural manager** is someone with political vision, able to formulate a plan; another speaker said that **cultural animator** is a name no longer used. The concern with names is not only formal: from these may depend the acceptance or not of a former student in a public tender, and, indirectly, the future of the course. Other speakers mention the creation of cultural management observatories, as well as expert panels, bringing together people who may suddenly respond to queries via internet about facts and policy decisions that affect the cultural management. The representative of *La Fábrica*, from Spain, exemplified citing an opinion poll about a new law of private patronage in the country, and tenders for selection of quality projects coming from various municipalities.

6. Summary and conclusions

On the inaugural speech, the regional director of Sesc-SP, Danilo Santos de Miranda, after articulating necessary connections between ethics and culture¹⁴, stopped on the new frontier: culture and management. He started by asking if he could speak of cultural management autonomy *vis-à-vis* the management science as a whole (e.g., sociology of culture in relation to sociology), if it was being constituted as a profession or would only be limited to being the appendix of what is already being done.

In particular, he was concerned with the approach between two universes chaired by opposite logics - the world of management and the world of art - and the dispute that could set precedence. Worried, he wondered if, in its essence, the administration, in its

¹³ Acc. to the mapping "Education in cultural management, cultural production and entertainment: undergraduation and graduation," available at <www.gestaocultural.org.br/estudos>. The representative of the Universidade Três de Fevereiro, in Argentina, mentioned a report from Unesco, of 2006, that listed 80 cultural management programs in Latin America, including 15 in the graduate level. The difference in numbers suggests a marked expansion in the last five years, certainly general to the subcontinent set.

¹⁴More information, please see Miranda (2011).

classic corporate form, the Taylorism, would not threaten with its standardizing instinct, the richness, diversity and spontaneity of cultural life. In this passage, Miranda was based on Theodor Adorno, critical of the "administered society", who had anticipated such a dilemma, but who had just surrendered to realism to recognize that "left to itself, but everything that is not only cultural threat lose the possibility of the effect, but also its very existence." Miranda hence confirmed, even with Adorno, that am occasional refusal of the artists to administer their work "not only deprives them form the possibility of earning a living, but also the whole effect of all contact between the work of art and society, without which the works of greater integrity could not pass, lest they perishing."

The ideas generated at the Meeting allow to conclude that there are no risks, in Brazil or abroad, of threats to the deepest values of cultural life arising from institutionalization, expansion and improvement of quality of management. It is what is concluded form the historical contexts to which the speeches, directly or indirectly, refer, and which the literature mobilized in this analysis confirms.

Firstly, it must be recalled that the transformations of capitalism would eventually dethrone organization models inspired on the obsession with industrial standardization of the engineer Frederick Taylor (1856-1915). They were replaced by more flexible production and distribution of goods and services imposed by irreversible and inexhaustible market segmentation, triggered in mid-twentieth century. Commercialization, correctly said the lecturer from Centro de Estudos Latino-Americanos sobre Cultura e Comunicação, from Escola de Comunicações e Artes da Universidade de São Paulo (Celacc/ECA/USP), accompanies and reinforces the existence of niches, rather than reducing it. It is therefore compatible, and even thrives on diversity, and not vice versa. The cultural administrators must know how to navigate the sea of so much diversity, enhancing it. In this sense, the work within teams, which are born and dissolve depending on the projects that arise and end, is what's best to bridge the gap between management and art, refusing permanent bureaucracies and authoritarian uprights. The name for that is "adhocracy", as seen.

Secondly, given the long-term trends in the working world, it is extremely unlikely that cultural managers will someday be a powerful profession, as were medicine, engineering and law. Technical developments, the commercialization of higher education, the constellations of values of the younger generation, among other factors

conspire to the contrary. They may have their own identity, a more defined field of work, a more coherent education - all desirable and deserved, no doubt - but always dealing with very many different categories of partners and competitors within and outside the institutions where they act.

Thirdly, the final triumph of the concept of "art for art" as key position in the world of aesthetics since the victory of modernism, buried once the possibility of return of the academies official bureaucratic power, which, in most cases, poorly survived to the nineteenth century.

Fourth, capitalism extrapolated to the whole set of economic life, from neoliberalism, the rhetoric of worship to personal autonomy and creativity as a reason for the survival of economic players and their triumph in the market. This means it "universalized" an ideology that before was limited to the arts, and that is exactly opposite to the original "Taylorist" bureaucratization.

Fifth, the programs presented at the Meeting, mostly Latin American, the primacy of popular culture, and with it, the diversity is amply hegemonic. For better or for worse, is a trend contrary to standard principles in cultural management. If this leads to a political and ideological bias, spurious to the art world as a presenter contended, is another problem¹⁵. The truth is that economic difficulties for the operation of federal courses newly deployed, its urban location sometimes in poor and violent neighborhoods, and the audience they recruit, left predominance in the lower classes and in direct contact with the effervescence of spontaneous artistic manifestations, very difficult for an authoritarian view, bureaucratic, or those socially selective educational programs that barely begin to operate. Hence the field of scholar, moreover poorly ventilated at the Meeting, has been named often pejoratively of "fine art" as something anachronistic, as if it dealt with almost everything that is considered cultural heritage of humanity (at least until now). Not for nothing, the only speaker (Itaú Cultural) who complained of excessive ideology in management and cultural policy debate in Brazil, who demanded conceptual precision in the distinction between art and culture, and that stood as the very low maximum calamity position country in international rankings of quality of education, was exactly the one who obtained the highest approval from the audience

¹⁵ For theoretical and policy orientations, remember that there are several program coordinators that come from the academic area of Communication. This area was structured in Brazil for many years in the complaint of the strength of private capital in control of the mass media, giving up a position there very categorical and incisive. See examples in Bolaño (2010) and Calabria (2009).

(74% excellent), on a survey conducted during the meeting. This suggests there is an unsatisfied demand for positions that do not conjure the need to clearly articulate the popular and classical. This hypothesis, however, cannot be further developed here, because the audience manifested in the meeting only through written questions, not all, in fact, answered.

At the end of the examination of all the material left by the Meeting, it is notable that the consensus perceived in the way to define the cultural manager and the set of skills that are expected of him/her. In the words of one speaker, the cultural manager should be someone who can "manage complexity, solve problems and minimize uncertainty," a sentence that sums up, with elegance, almost the same as all other participants wanted to say, each in their own way. Another added a crucial distinction, namely, that the cultural manager, before being an expert in any theory of aesthetic culture or language, is an "expert in the social organization of culture." It is a formulation that would strengthen, in the curriculum, disciplines that deal exactly with this: anthropology and sociology.

It is now necessary to synthetic respond to the **topics proposed** to participants during the call:

The argument developed here, all the time dealt with the issue of construction **parameters** of programs and curricula for education of cultural managers. No matter what field of study concerned, building parameters is always something that concerns the general state of theoretical and practical knowledge that wants to transmit to its domain, the teachers of the institution that will host the course, the legal requirements of national education and rules of the institution, the perception of the existence of an unsatisfied demand for new skills and competencies and potential students interested in supply them, and the time they can or want to devote to learning¹⁶.

The argumentation also dealt with the question of the **evaluation systems** applied, once, in order to build the ideal definition of cultural manager in the speeches of the Meeting showed that the fundamental, as reviewed, is the construction of a cultural project, as currently understood by excellence of the poof of student synthesis capacity, and deserving a special and individualized care: mentoring. This method is more consistent with the proposed formation of a professional who knows how to connect several

¹⁶ All this supposes care to compare teaching systems, as advert Bourdieu and Passeron (1967).

points: the theories learned in the classroom (and its conceptual blends), internships in cultural institutions, perception of the future scenario in which the project could take place, anticipation of possible partners and mastery of their language and their interests¹⁷.

However, the **relationship between education and the labor market** was examined from the speeches, which are accepted here, obviously, for their nominal value, and pointing in different directions as well: students who disrupt the course simply because they got jobs and do not return, or students who avoid the risk of job search extending college life in other graduations (Brazilian federal universities), students who find employment in the cultural area following their graduation, but not so durable (Dijon), students who find placement due to the high prestige not exactly of their course, but the school that provides it (Paris-Dauphine); students who find employment in government departments led by someone connected to the program (UFBa); students that do not need the course to find work because they are already professionals of the area (Barcelona, Girona, among others); students who go to the course already temporarily "pre-allocated" to an employer by virtue of agreements (Ferrara); students presented with thriving market due to mega events (Rio de Janeiro).

Regarding the **monitoring of students in the labor market**, the most important thing to note is the personal commitment of some course coordinators to compile personal addresses and collect personal information by e-mail, in insisting that alumni become members of the associations formed, in denouncing tender notices which may exclude graduates for their courses, in listing learning programs that arise, etc. The representative of Paris-Dauphine said in this regard that, unlike other diplomas, in cultural management there are no associations of former students which can make this follow up easier. The representative of *La Fabrica*, Spain, in turn, keeps electronic records of former students and is prepared to survey occupational status. Overall, the present situation is far from that possibility that old professions had to map the route of their members in the labor market and their mobility trace of an economic sector to another and from one level of income to another¹⁸.

¹⁷ Despite the centrality of the project, in some cases a monograph is accepted as a condition for graduation.

¹⁸ In general, it is very difficult to predict what proportion of a class of graduates will be absorbed by the market, and at what pace, even when there is plenty of information on demand and supply of labor, the employment forecasts for a specific graduation are always, at best, approximate, built on top of much conjecture.

7. Final recommendation

The rich material provided by the Meeting points to extent and nature difficulties faced by various training programs of cultural managers in Brazil. The depth of national education standards are an example, given the rigidity of curricula and conducts teacher accustomed to teaching exclusively in a classroom a disciplinary knowledge which is not always updated. It is a difficulty that has become all acute in times like the present, of quick and decided opening of the system to historically excluded segments, whose young people come to higher education with serious deficits in basic skills. The climate of accelerated social inclusion can also stimulate an enthusiasm for popular culture to cease feeding intolerance towards the repertoire of high culture, distorting the view of the manager in the scenario where he/she needs to operate. Moreover, particular courses that need to be financed with revenue from tuition fees and operate on a logic which excludes short-term investments and the waiting time required to develop new knowledge or due to appropriate knowledge available.

It remains therefore an **open space**, in Brazil, for organizations not necessarily educational, but with other legal and institutional profiles, with experience and financial resources to act with its own program, reinforcing or changing trends, guidelines and hence policy outcomes public. This is the case of Sesc.

The formation of cultural managers can thus be seen as open space for new education programs, which already get free from the difficulties of the existing programs, but also, alternatively, as the lines open space key supporting existing programs. For example, assembly lines of research that focus on the knowledge of cultural management as practiced in the country, or to localize in the international literature that disciplinary knowledge is spread priority in Brazil, and, for whatever reason, the university is reluctant to do it. A look at the historical experience of private philanthropy in countries where it is solid and rooted, and the role that, over time, has been played by foundations maintained by large economic conglomerates in the field of culture is indeed essential. But it may already be the subject of a new meeting.

Bibliography

- BOLAÑO, Cesar; GOLIN, Cida; BRITTOS, Valério (orgs.). Economia da arte e da cultura. São Paulo: Itaú Cultural; São Leopoldo, Cepos/Unisinos; Porto Alegre: PPGCOM/UFRGS; São Cristovão: Obscom/UFS, 2010.
- BOLTANSKI, Luc;CHIAPELLO, Ève. *O novo espírito do capitalismo*. São Paulo: WMF Martins Fontes, 2009.
- BOURDIEU, P. Les règles de l'art. Genèse et structure du champ littéraire. Seuil, Paris, 1992.
- BOURDIEU, P.; PASSERON, J.-C. "La comparabilité des systèmes d'enseignement".
 In: CASTEL, Robert; PASSERON, J.-C. (orgs.). *Education, développement et democratie*. Paris: La Haye, Mouton, 1967.
- BOUTANG, Yann M. L'abeille et l'économiste. Paris: Carnet Nord, 2010.
- CALABRE, Lia (org.). *Políticas culturais: reflexões e ações*. São Paulo: Itaú Cultural; Rio de Janeiro: Fundação Casa de Rui Barbosa, 2009.
- DURAND, J. C. Arte, privilégio e distinção. Artes plásticas, arquitetura e classe dirigente no Brasil, 1855/1985. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2009. (reimpressão).
- _____. *Política cultural e economia da cultura*. São Paulo: Ateliê Editorial; Sesc. (noprelo).
- FRIEDMAN, Milton; KUZNETS, Simon. Income from independent professional practice. New York, National Bureau of Economic Research, 1945.
- LECLERC-OLIVE, Michèle; GHELLAB, GraziaScarfò; WAGNER, Anne-Catherine (eds.). Les mondes universitaires face au marché. Circulation des savoirs et pratiques des auteurs. Paris: Karthala, 2011.
- MAURICE, Marc. "Propos sur la sociologie des professions". Sociologie du Travail, Paris, v. 13, n. 2, p. 213-225, avril-juin 1972.

MIRANDA, Danilo S. de (org.). Ética e cultura. São Paulo: Perspectiva; Sesc, 2011.

- MOUREAU, Nathalie. "Approche organisationnelle des mondes de la peinture contemporaine: de la 'bureaucratie professionnelle' à 'l'adhocratie'. In: *Approches comparatives en économie de la culture*. Paris: Université de Paris I, InterGroupe de Recherche en Economie de la Culture, 1995. p. 312-326.
- SILVA, Frederico A. Barbosa da.*Política Cultural no Brasil, 2002-2006: acompanhamento e análise*. Brasília: Ministério da Cultura, 2007.
- WU, Chin-Tao.Privatização da cultura. A intervenção corporativa nas artes desde os anos 80. São Paulo:Boitempo;Sesc, 2006.

Nacionalities, speekers, institutions and programs present at the International Meeting *Education in Cultural Management* [complete with the electronic addresses where the reader can find more information].

ARGENTINA

JOSÉ TASAT: Universidade Nacional de Três de Fevereiro (Untref) [February 3rd National University].

LAURA ISABEL ROMERO: Architecture, Urban Planning and Design College of *Universidade Nacional de Mar del Plata* [Mar del Plata National University]. "Technical Graduation" in cultural management.

URSULA RUCKER: Associação de Gestores Culturais da República Argentina/AgeCultuRA [Argentina Republic Cultural Manager Association].

BRAZIL

ANDREA COSTA: *Instituto Federal de Educação, Ciência e Tecnologia do Rio Grande do Norte* [Federal Institute of Education, Science and Technology of Rio Grande do Norte]. Technological Graduation. Technology in Cultural Production.

DENNIS DE OLIVEIRA: *Universidade de São Paulo* [São Paulo University], Communication and Arts College (ECA), *Centro de Estudos Latino-Americanos sobre Cultura e Comunicação* (Celacc) [Latin-American Studies Center on Culture and Communication]. Specialization Course in Management of Cultural Projects and Events Organization.

FERNANDA DELVALHAS PICCOLO: *Instituto Federal de Educação, Ciência e Tecnologia do Rio de Janeiro* [Federal Institute of Education, Science and Technology of Rio de Janeiro]. College Degree in Cultural Production Technology.

GLEY FABIANO CARDOSO XAVIER e SOLEDAD GALHARDO: *Centro Universitário Senac* [Senac University Center]. Especialization in Cultural Management: Culture, Development and Market.

JOSE TEIXEIRA COELHO NETTO: *Instituto Cultural Itaú* [Itaú Cultural Institute]. *Observatório Itaú Cultural* [Itaú Cultural Observatory]. Specialization Course in Cultural Management.

KATIA DE MARCO: Universidade Candido Mendes [Candido Mendes University]. Post-Graduation in Cultural Management (*lato sensu*).

LUIZ AUGUSTO FERNANDES RODRIGUES: *Universidade Federal Fluminense* [Fluminense Federal University], *Instituto de Artes e Comunicação Social* [Institute of Ars and Social Communication]. Cultural Production Course.

PAULO CESAR MIGUEZ: *Universidade Federal da Bahia* (UFBa) [Bahia Federal University]. Multidisciplinary Post-Graduation Program in Culture and Society.

CHILE

ROBERTO GUERRA: *Escola de Gestores e Animadores Culturais* (Egac) [Cultural Manager and Animator School].

<u>SPAIN</u>

ALBERTO FESSER: Universidade Europeia de Madri [Madri European University]. Master La Fabrica in Cultural Engineerign.

ALFONS MARTINELL SEMPERE: *Universidade de Girona e Cátedra Unesco* [Girona and Unesco Chairs University]. Specialization Course in Cultural Management (virtual modality)

ANGEL MESTRES VILA: Universidade de Barcelona [Barcelona University]. Master in Cultural Management.

FRANCE

EDWIN JUNO-DELGADO: *Grupo ESC Dijon Bourgogne* [ESC Dijon Bourgogne Group]. Specialization Course in Management of Cultural Institutions and Creative Industries.

PATRICK OLIVIER: *Universidade Paris 9-Dauphine* [Paris 9 - Dauphine University]. Management Course of Cultural Institutions.

ITALY

ELENA BORIN: *Universidade de Ferrara* [Ferrara University]. Department of Economics, Institutions and Territory. International Master in Cultural Management.

MEXICO

JOSÉ LUIS MARISCAL OROZCO: Universidade de Guadalajara [Guadalajara University]. Instituto de Gestão do Conhecimento e da Aprendizagem em Ambientes Virtuais [Institute of Knowledge and Learning Management in Virtual Environments]. Bachelor's Degree in Cultural Management.

PORTUGAL

ISABEL BABO-LANÇA: *Universidade Lusófona do Porto* [Lusófona do Porto University]. Post-Graduation in Communication and Cultural Management.

<u>URUGUAY</u>

ANDREA FANTONI: *Centro Latinoamericano de Economía Humana* (CLAEH) [Latin American Center of Human Economy]. Bachelor's Degree in Cultural Management.